

Resituating Home and Politics for Women

By Women:

Hindi Print Domain in Colonial India

Dr .Priyamvada Tiwari,

Centre for Historical Studies, Jawaharlal Nehru University, New Delhi.

In this paper I attempt an examination of the loci where women's education was affected and was in turn affected by the Hindi literary discourse. The late nineteenth century gender narrative in the Hindi print sphere was defined by the emergence of an element unique and predictable in the same instance. Women and girls of the Hindi region, were, through their educated selves accessing the outside world, the sphere of the public via the print medium. ⁱEducation was believed to be a panacea for all their sufferings, an answer to queries, suspicions and doubts; creating an avenue for self expression and a forum for empathetic sisterhood. ⁱⁱThe association of women's education with the general improvement of society was well established by the twentieth century: "Educating a girl means educating a family" was the widely prevalent reformist discourse. ⁱⁱⁱScholarship on education and literature views the availability of the printing press as a means of literary production implied a radical change in communication-both in its scope and aims. ^{iv}Krishna Kumar calls it a change far more important in terms of change in the meaning of literacy than the expansion of elementary education which was extremely slow and was based on poor practices. The education that schools were providing was only important as a means of social selection. Far more vital education, as a process of reconstructing worthwhile knowledge and disseminating it, was taking place under the auspices of magazines and literature. ^v Through this article I have also tried to allay Kumkum Sangari's fears that such studies produce a simplified notion of patriarchy 'crudely hammering life and

literature together^{vi}. On the contrary such studies are useful relocations of female agency, rendering visible the "unseen half" of history ;besides, of course providing an immense treasure of new tools of research to scholars of gender history. While reading literary representations, ^{vii}concessions have to be made for the authors' subjectivities, but then that holds true for all other 'purely historical' records .I shall through an understanding of the vernacular literature of the period under study ,try to raise some valid questions in the understanding of the process of education of women of UP. Literary discourse of this period is thus of historical significance and merits attention in all works related to socio-cultural processes.

By the mid nineteenth century, a substantial publishing industry had grown up in urban centres in different provinces. In Bengal the publication of Bengali language books had become an income producing activity and printed and after the 1854 government-mandated expansion of English language education ,textbooks (and their even more lucrative 'epitomes" or cram books)became an important part of the industry,not only in English but also in the vernaculars in most other provinces of the country^{viii}.

For urban middle class men of UP the 'women's question' was the burning issue of the day.^{ix} The social reform movement and the parallel Hindi movement in this province, as in rest of India,was led by a group of indigenous elite men who were concerned with rebutting Western criticism of the denial of knowledge to Indian women, and were interested in grooming upper caste,middle class (primarily urban)women to meet the new needs of their own professional and service status. The evolution of Hindi literature thus coincided with this new-born reformist status of the men of this region. Education for women became the pivot of all reformist activities was one of the most profusely written about subjects in contemporary Hindi writings.^x

Were the educated middle class men of UP like Acharya Mahaveer Prasad Dwivedi, who wrote at length about the necessity of education for women of the province, or the urban elite like Bharatendu Harishchandra who provided monetary support to keen women students besides advocating education for them in his journals and mainstream writings, themselves mentally prepared to accept the

infringement of western thinking on what was so far the stronghold of tradition in the province---the women's mind? Their writings become crucial for our understanding of the conflicts that patriarchy in this period was wrought with. The dependence of patriarchies on representation is antecedent to, and so more central than the issue of women's absence or invisibility. Patriarchies function partly through material divisions of labour and economic resources and partly through various forms of representation. The relation between social practice and representational form is complex. Therefore what is called 'literature' plays an important role in understanding patriarchies as do economies. These representations become important methodological tools of historical research in spheres characterized by 'Administrative Silence'^{xi}; women's history being the most prominent such field. I am interested here in the intersection of colonial modernity and the embryonic liberalism of the first generation of educated women and its implications for the daily, the domestic, the familial and the personal. In this chapter I examine the loci where women's education affected and was in turn influenced by the contemporary Hindi literary discourse. At the outset, I would like to allay Kumkum Sangari's fears that such studies produce a simplified notion of patriarchy 'crudely hammering life and literature together'^{xii}. On the contrary such studies are useful relocations of female agency, rendering visible the "unseen half" of history; besides, of course providing an immense treasure of new tools of research to scholars of gender history. While reading literary representations, concessions have to be made for the authors' subjectivities, but then that holds true for all other 'purely historical' records. I shall through an understanding of the vernacular literature of the period under study, try to raise some valid questions in the understanding of the process of education of women of UP. Literary discourse of this period is thus of historical significance and merits attention in all works related to socio-cultural processes.

One of the most significant features of the largely male dominated discourse about women was its ambivalence, resulting from the cohesion and collision of the contemporary forces of nationality, patriarchy and colonialism. This spirit perhaps derived its strength from the enthusiasm at contributing to the richness of 'their' language Hindi in the Nagri script, and aiding its growth against the so rival Urdu,

Camouflaging claims of emancipating women concealed the motive of reinforcing patriarchal restrictions on their new found and 'granted' liberties through education. The tone of their writings was impersonal and removed, and most of the times conformed to the contemporary structures & trends of literature. In order to understand how the pathetically slow and complex process of women's education registered itself in the minds of the 'middle class'^{xiii} reformist male it becomes imperative to follow the evolution of the male mind through the writings of litterateurs situated chronologically at different phases of this experiment. Bharatendu, by virtue of his standing as the pioneer of women's reform in the Hindi region is clearly the most appropriate representative of the reformist mind positively inclined to the education of women. Bharatendu's contribution to the Hindi literary world in general and representation of women's issues in particular has been widely studied by scholars of literature^{xiv} and history.^{xv} Bharatendu's views particularly on women's education have also been dealt with in a separate work^{xvi}. This article will explore the extension of middle class reforms and practices to matters related to reform of women's social condition. I will try to locate the deviation of the early twentieth century mind from the ideology that dominated the previous century in the United Provinces, and examine the extent to which educated women's initiatives challenged reformist male attitudes. The logic behind the choice of these two writers for this section rests in their social and literary standing. What Bharatendu and Premchand had to say about the woman question in their respective periods when it was the most strongly debated topic would carry the weight of social and cultural authority and therefore merits analysis and comparison. However, there were very few women writers in the period, and even a lesser number among them were 'recognized' by prevalent standards of high literary tradition. Women's writings, on the other hand, used the language they were well versed with— their tones were mostly personal, and the subject of their writing mostly mundane but also awakening and enlightening in several cases. Moreover, even among those whose writings are visible in the literary corpus, a sizeable proportion devoted much space and attention to the prescribed norms of propriety, of *Pativrata Dharma*, of *Maryada* and of *Adarsh Grihini*. Nevertheless, thoughts of an independently developing intellectual are discernible at various places. In this article, I shall, therefore in two different sections

Commented [DJA1]: Add reference to Sanjay Joshi's Fractured Modernity

look at male and female writers of the period separately, appreciating the contextual differences of their creation, and shall also, in a separate section, study the didactic literature for women composed by both men and women. I intend to thus gain an understanding of what educated men thought of the education of women, and educated women, what level of knowledge did they deem 'proper' to be imparted, to be acquired by women and how did they aspire to enforce their unwritten laws.^{xvii} Through a study of female writings, of 'the not so well known', marginalized writers, I wish to peep into their worlds, to gain an access to their thoughts and locate the situations and contexts that informed their ideas and concepts. The third section will comprise of a short survey of didactic vernacular literature of the period which shall be helpful in distinguishing what men wanted their women to learn from what women actually learnt and taught others.

Section - I

MIDDLE CLASS MALE PERCEPTIONS OF HINDU WOMEN'S EDUCATION AND ITS LIMITATIONS:

Grihalakshmis, 'Titlis', or None?

Social reformers in U.P, by the end of the nineteenth century, were, aware of social disabilities that restricted the 'modernization' of women in the province^{xviii}. Hindi grew from the synthesis of Sanskrit and Hindustani, its Nagari script was different from the kharee and its texture was to a large extent divided from the much in use *kharee boli*. Participation in the development and modernisation of this language was at once an instrument and a symbol of propagation of Hindu nationhood.^{xix} The utility of this instrument could be extended to yet another reformist project, that which was perceived to be the most significant marker of the growth and of progress, the women's education. A sudden need was felt to create a separate literature, a suitable reading material for women. Propagation of women's education could not be carried out within the parameters of either of the two extremes, Sanskrit and Hindi. Scriptural language Sanskrit was not suitable for educating women, being ill-conducive to the spirit of modernization that had intoxicated the mind of every western educated middle class Hindu. The bureaucratic foreign language English on the other hand was wrought with

dangers of 'polluting' their women .Hindi offered the middle path ungrudgingly by these men to the uneducated, 'weaker' sex. An interesting account appears in the an unexpected source-C.F.Ballantyne a teacher in a Boys school in UP reports that his Students had very little knowledge of Shuddha Hindi. On finding this, he rebuked them and said that they would better learn their own language which they deemed fit to be learnt by women only^{xx} The perception that women had remained the bulwark of India's moral strength because they had not been educated was common. It became popular particularly when revivalist movements such as Arya Samaj took up the task of indigenising education towards the end of the nineteenth century. An interesting articulation of this view occurs in a Hindi essay by Pratap Narayan Mishra,entitled "Swatantra":

Eeshwar ki kripa se bharat ki striyon par kaliyug ka prbav sampurna roop se nahi pada hai.Wohi hain jineh aryatva ki sthirta me vishwas hai anyatha aap sab toh cigar ki laume sab jhonk ke chhabbees akshar ka mantra padh rahe hain.

("Due to the grace of God,the impact of Kaliyug has not yet been absolute in the case of India's women. They are the ones to show the greatest faith in the stability of Aryanism,otherwise,you (that is,men)have poured everything into the fire of cigar while reciting the twenty six letter Mantra(the english alphabets)"^{xxi}

While ridicule and reprimand for men for their anglicised behaviour is unequivocally expressed here.They have learnt the English language and have tuned into the brown sahibs that Macaulay prophesied. However, the classic paradigm of women being the bearers of the burden of tradition,appears concretised here.Women were to be haloed as the ones who were capable of keeping 'Aryatva' (Aryanism) alive and therefore the question of their reform was to be dealt with differently.Pratapnarayan wrote further,

"Our education system today is so rotten(*satyanash*) today that our unlettered women are better. Not only are they good at household chores like cleaning or cooking,they can also make a living by their skills like sewing and embroidery while our gentlemen are capable only of making their two ends meet through their jobs"^{xxii}

More than a critique of the contemporary education system Pratapnarayan appears to be voicing an apprehension here. The middle class educated male had always been living with this fear. What if their women lose their 'qualities' of being the guardians of their faith and honour. They were capable of making a living through sewing and embroidery while taking care of the household, why should they be exposed to the dangers of a rotten education system which threatened their purity and skill? Hindi literature of this period is replete with such writings and posits a wide scope of research, some of which has yielded encouraging results.

In this section I will study Bharatendu Harishchandra's views on woman's question through what may be called his mouthpiece on this issue, his journal *Balabodhini* and his non-fictional writings for women. To comprehend the outlook of men of a later generation on this issue, I will use Premchand's articles and his fictional works. I, thus, intend to formulate the difference if any, in the male attitudes towards women's reform in particular and the gender equation in particular, brought about after a decade of women's educational enterprise. Bharatendu Harishchandra started the first women's journal *Balabodhini* in 1874. Calcutta and Bombay had already witnessed the founding of women's journals by reformists by the mid-nineteenth century.^{xxiii} As the first women's journal in Hindi, *Balabodhini* occupies a place of importance in literary history.^{xxiv} It was published with the motto of educating women^{xxv}. The inaugural issue of the journal carried the message that expressed the idea behind its publication:

My dear sisters! I, your new sister Balabodhini have come to meet you, and have the desire to see you once every month. See, I am younger to all of you in age because all of you are grown up and I have just been born. So I am your younger sister, but I want to be your friend. Therefore, I plead you with folded hands to forgive me if I say anything harsh, bitter or unpleasant to you, for all that I say will be for your good.^{xxvi}

In spite of the recent work done in this field by historians of education and feminism in India, there is a conspicuous gap in its understanding, specifically because of the attempt to mainstream the movement in Bengal and Maharashtra. Bharatendu and his group of writers were eloquent in their concern over the issue of women's education, their critique of the reformist stand on the "Women's Question" should be read in conjunction with the more conservative tracts to facilitate a more textured understanding of the issue.

Bharatendu was a pioneer not only in the propagation of nationalist Hindi literature, but also the harbinger of what come to be known as the age of the humanist literature in Hindi.^{xxvii} Middle class contradictions on the issue of women's reform and education were however easily detected in his writings which were characteristically ambivalent on the issue

of women's reform. The subtitle of the journal *Balabodhini*, for example, exhorted the women of India to emulate the learned ladies of the glorious past;^{xxviii} Harish Chandra himself is believed to have openly advocated women's education: "It has been proved that the NWP cannot progress till its women also are not educated, since if men are educated and wise and their wives fools (uneducated), they will never be in love, shall always fight each other".^{xxix} The purpose of women's education was thus defined in utilitarian vocabulary. If educated, women can have a loving relation with their husbands, proving their compatibility to their educated and 'wise' husbands. Such logic for propagation of women's education was pregnant with serious implications for the changing conjugal relations in the colonial context.. While earlier, women adept in social and domestic skills were sought in marriage, education had now become an additional imperative for them. Though not explicitly voiced, such expressions classify as one of the earliest statements on assuaging the changing gender equations due to the impact of western formal education. However, education was to be made accessible to women by men^{xxx} only, for women did not realise the true worth of learning and it was a bitter pill for them: "If any of your brothers gives you the bitter medicine of education, you should consider him your real brother, give him your true affection and, follow him on the path of progress"^{xxxi} The tenor of this statement, as of other directives for women was puritanical and indifferent ,very different from the wit and humour so characteristic of Bharatendu's other literary contributions.^{xxxii} Bharatendu uses a very different vocabulary and tone when writing for women, probably to underline his patronizing reformist approach towards women. This difference in the tenor of the language for men and women may also have originated from the much prevalent practice of the use of different dialects by men and women in their respective gender groups and also while interacting with one another.

Both-Bharatendu and Premchand were fascinated by the 'true' (perhaps

exotic in modern parlance)beauty of the low caste/class women. The rustic charm of these women was romanticized by these authors repeatedly. While Bharatendu was of the opinion that knowledge has no currency in Hindi household ,not even in the loftiest among them ;in fact it often finds favour in the house of the lowly Premchand created characters like Mulia. Even though there were instances when the non-literate, uneducated, pitiable state of women was lamented upon, such statements were carefully worded and presented with due support to the 'grihalakshmihood' of women of the region:

"When I see slim and fit English ladies with perfumed hair, artificial buns, precious jewels, moving around with their husbands as cheerful as young girls, I am reminded of the plain and deplorable condition of women of this country and this becomes the cause of immense grief and despair for me. Let no one be misguided by this and think that I want the Lakshmi of our families to discard their shame and around with their husbands. I cannot even dream about such a thing. But they (British women) can be emulated in other aspects. Just as these women are aware, educated, perform household duties educate their children, are self-conscious and have an opinion on the issues of their country, contribute to its development and do not waste this precious life in household duties and quarrels, similarly our household deities should also get out of their present state of deprivation and try to progress".^{xxxiii}

The educative agenda in his writings attempts to urbanise ,modernize and make the housewife and mother the domestic key to the social well being of the nuclear family. Bharatendu for instance, writes ,

"Fathers never love their daughters ,nor take any steps to educate them, because if educated they will be spoilt "^{xxxiv}

One of the first few schools for girls in UP was opened in Varanasi by Thomason. Bharatendu's sister was enrolled in this school in spite of the vernacular schooling of his father. A British school background was therefore not mandatory for the men to be progressive in their approach towards their daughters. Bharatendu was a supporter of Miss Carpenter in her educative ventures .He even used to give felicitations in the form of benarasi saris to girls of different provinces for excellence in academics^{xxxv} Bharatendu however remained silent about his daughter's education, and there is a only a vague reference to adequate measures taken towards her education. Instances like this were not uncommon,where men who preached reform in the public

domain never practised it within their households. They create a new gender discourse as a resultant impact of sanatanist Hindu and Victorian ideals of domesticity, stressing upon education because men needed good wives and children, good mothers. These issues contested so vehemently in this period were largely missing from women's journals. Women were not expected to participate let alone determine the resolution of the issues at stake. This conspicuous absence of women could also be simply because there were not many women who could write or contribute to these journals.

Fissures in middle class project of modernization and reform of women were apparent even at its inception. The magazine *Balabodhini* carried a simple message in its issues - '*Nari Nar Sam Hohi*'^{xxxvi}- the idea was revolutionary and unheard of. The deployment of such a phrase by someone who laments the unequal position of women in his times is not entirely unanticipated. In one of his treatises, Bharatendu wrote: "Formerly, daughters and sons had the same status, and all their activities were the same. Even though the Lord has given men and women an equal part in the origin and sustenance of his creation, and there are many tasks in the world which only we (women) can perform. We do not know why minds have been so twisted that people lose heart the moment they hear (we) poor creatures have been born."^{xxxvii} Such expressions however appear incongruous when placed alongside the articles that define a woman's dharma only in terms of her true devotion to her husband. *Prempathik* is a skit based on the dialogue between Rama and Sita when they were serving exile in the forest. Though borrowed from Tulsidas' *Ramcharitamanas*, the context here is secular. Sita is portrayed as the ideal housewife and seems to be Bharatendu's mouthpiece when she says:

"Sorrows and happiness of a woman are subservient to her husband. Even Baikunth (the Heavenly abode of Vishnu, the Hindu God who upkeeps the universe) is useless for her without her husband, and even a forest is more than a thousand Baikunths to her when she is with him."^{xxxviii}

Writing in the second decade of the twentieth century, Premchand structured his ideal of a good woman in a manner that opposed the idea of indiscriminate equality between men and women^{xxxix}. The two had to perform different functions in society. So their

equality had to be so designed as to meet the society's functional need .His conception of a good woman ,therefore was one that trained them to be ideal housewives and mothers .Writing months before his death ,feeling not quite happy that women should be aspiring for jobs that men had traditionally performed ,he wanted educated women to be patterned as good mistresses of the household and not merely as social 'butterflies'^{xi}The ground was thus laid for the .Westernization and introduction of scientific thoughts to women was essential, but without deviating from the well accepted and established image of *grihalakshmi*. Women were to be aware, informed and educated but also shy and coy - not willing to move out with their husbands in public.The project of women's education was driven to a great extent by the reformist male enterprise to consolidate its hegemony in erstwhile semi--autonomous feminine spaces. Even though precolonial forms of indigenous education were conspicuously restrictive in terms of proscribed access to women ,it was, nevertheless imparted and determined to a large extent by women themselves.^{xii} In the new colonial-reformist-modern context male intrusion in all stages of this process was obvious---an unschooled^{xiii} woman was counseled about the benefits of education for better conjugal relations, in the next phase syllabi for the woman receiving formal education was designed to suit the male intelligentsia's imaginings of women; finally, the educated women were repeatedly instructed to emulate in letter and spirit the ideals of the illustrious devis of the glorious Indian past, in order to establish (just the right)ideal for their uneducated sisters. Western women were to be looked upon as role models, but not imitated. Their participation in the process of 'modernizing' women of the middle class ended with the imparting of basic education to these women. This role, was however very crucial, to the extent that the slow pace of growth of women's education in the region was said to be largely due to the indifference of European ladies. In his submissions made to the Hunter Commission^{xliii} Bharatendu, while acknowledging the general aversion to girls' education in the province, emphasized the lack of interest on the part of European ladies as one of the basic reasons for the pathetic pace of development of female education. He said that if European ladies took keen interest in visiting Indian households to educate women, a positive difference may be visible in this field.^{xliv}There are very few public schools for indigenous education of girls.I

know one or two of the kind. There is a large school of this class at Benaras supported by His Highness the Maharaja of Vizianagaram, attended by about 500 girls under the supervision of European ladies. But it must be remembered that almost all the girls under are paid for attendance and the majority of them come from the low classes. There is little inclination on the part of the natives of this country to send their girls to public schools they are generally opposed to such a scheme. But we have something like 'home' education. Respectable people do not wish to send their girls of whatever age they may be, to a public school, whether under the management of Government or private individuals; and therefore they generally employ a tutor of their own to educate their girls. The home education is often of a religious character and has little to do with western enlightenment. Religious books containing lessons on principles of morality are generally read. The Mohemmadans teach Koran to their girls. European ladies of the civil, military or Education departments have shown little interest, but their visits to the Zenana have seldom been reckoned as beneficial, they are naturally inclined to inculcate religious principles and free thought which instead of creating in the minds of native women the desire for education, generally make them averse to it. They are led to consider that the sole aim of such ladies is to convert them and therefore they scrupulously avoid mixing with the supposed enemies of their religions."^{xlv}

Committed educationists of the province saw education as the panacea of all social ills and believed that women's education would be a primary agent of social change. Education was necessary for and prior to social reform. However, female education could not be widely disseminated without changing family and wider society, that is without undertaking social reform. Hindi journals of the period published articles profusely denying all the negative effects of women's education. *Saraswati*^{xlvi} was the mouthpiece of many agencies and reformist men advocating education for women. Mahaveer Prasad Dwivedi wrote in one of the articles published in this journal, "Education in itself does not have any disastrous impact. It definitely does not bear the seed of disaster. Disaster can be wrought by both men and women, by educated as well as illiterate. Education has no role to play in it. Therefore women must be educated"^{xlvi} Dwivedi considered all attempts to thwart the project of women's

education a social offence and the biggest obstacle in the progress of the society in general. For him, educating a woman was as important as educating a man. "*If education is beneficial for men, it is beneficial for women too, just as the medicine that cures a man's fever treats a woman too.*"^{xlviii} The acceptance of women's education as a social necessity however was as varied as was the response to education in the province. Mahaveer Prasad Dwivedi was a proponent of gendered division of labour, but was still an advocate of equality of men and women. He denied the social discrimination created between men and women but acknowledged biological distinction between the two. Dwivedi thus is a representative of the inherently self-contradictory perception of middle class male intelligentsia of the period. He advocated the gender discourse of the times, while simultaneously supporting the theory that the Indian ideological discourse was not anti women. Intellectual conflict as this paradoxically nurtured solidarity in their fight against colonialism among the middle class men of the period. Anti colonialism was driven by a thrust on every feature of the society that was not western or that was anti western. They were willing to mimic modern ways of living, to train their women in contemporary skills but without stepping on the threshold of modernity.

Dwivedi used the biologically delicate physique of the women as the logic behind the traditionally gendered division of labour, also an apt justification for Manu's infamous injunction.^{xlix} "*Women are innately weak and delicate. Their physical strength is much less compared to men, and are therefore incapable of protecting themselves. If in such a situation, they have been told to stay under the protection of husbands, fathers and sons, what's wrong in it? The weak can only thrive and prosper under the shadow of the strong, this is the only way they can attain peace and prosperity.*"^l The logic for role specific education was furthered against this backdrop-because a woman could survive only in the shadow of men's protection, she should be trained in a manner conducive to it. In *Striyon ka Samajik Jeewan*, he reiterates at many places, "*Striyon ko unki aawashyakta ke anuroop shiksha deni chahiye*" (Women should be educated according to their (functional) requirements). Dwivedi's beliefs were echoed in most of the writings of the period. Pandit Moolchand Bhatt wrote: "Women's education should be aimed at making them good wives, good mothers and good homemakers."^{li} The vehicle of domesticity in could be guided better if women were educated to create an

ideal for others, because men only drove the vehicle under the guidance of their wives. Women were thus invested with roles 'superior' to men, because they were to guide them and advise them, they had to be trained differently. While carrying out this haloed duty of being an advisor, a guide to men, they had to remain unaffected by the rigors of domesticity. "*Just as a swan floats on water without its wings getting wet, women should never get immersed in their households*"^{liii} wrote another proponent of women's role based education.

A section of Hindi writers of the period however vehemently opposed the disparity in curriculum for the two sexes. They were of the opinion that just as medicine, education must not be affected by gender of the recipient. Balkrishna Bhatt ^{liii} wrote a series of articles against traditional restrictive and limited curriculum prescribed by the middle class reformists of the period, admonishing the intrinsic resistance to change that characterised the middle class psyche of the period.

"Aisi Shiksha ko kaum ke patan ka prateek maana jaana chahiye. Jaisi shiksha ab tak hui use dekhkar sharm aatii hai. Shiksha aisi ho jo netra khole, bhoogol itithaas bhaanti bhaanti ke vigyaan inhein sikhaaye jaayein aur yah bhi theek theek inke mann me baith jaaye ki jo hum kar rahe hain aur ab tak karti aayi woh dharm ka abhaas nira adharm hai. Apni vartamaan patit giri disha ka poora poora bodh ho jaaye aur yah maanne lagein ki humein nipat bhooli aur seedhi samajh anek roop aur bhed se dhoort loag humse pujaate hain aur dharm ka bhay dikhlaay nitya nitya humein bigaadte jaate hain."^{liv}

(Such (role based) education should be considered a symbol of degeneration. It makes me feel ashamed (of ourselves). Education should be such that opens their eyes, teaches them geography, history and science, and it should be firmly registered in their minds that whatever they have been learning in the name of morality is nothing but immoral. They should be made aware of their present wretched condition and should accept that their simplicity and innocence has been exploited by these shrewd men who restricted them only to religious rituals, while degrading their status every passing day) (Translation mine)

This critique while analysing social and religious core of the conventional curriculum, establishes the connect between the woman's question and nationalism.

Women's education was visualised as the first step towards social progress, which however could only happen when they were given the same education as men.^{lv} Radical Brahmos in Bengal had always felt that there was no justification for instituting a separate curriculum for girls or limiting the level to which girls should be educated; mainstream Brahmos and the more enlightened sections of the Hindus advocated a limited education for girls which would serve the major purpose of making women intelligent companions for the emergent bhadrakalok and better mothers for the next generation. The education of women, it was argued, involved a very different set of values from the rationale, for instance, behind agitating for home rule and, later, legislative representation.^{lvi} Bhatt in his essays highlights the limitations of conventional education for women, which was so strongly advocated by most of the reformist men and women writers of the period. "British rule has altered the lives of one and all, but our women continue to be in the same state as they were fifty years ago. Our western educated men participate in meetings and conferences on modern thought and belief, while women still toil in their households, and are forced to live ordinary lives". He also analysed the reason for the failure of reform movements in bringing about any change in the lives of the women of the province. Dualism in the reformist discourse was an important reason for the miserable condition of the women in spite of their literacy. Bhatt underlined the need for reform of men's thought to bring about any reform in the women's condition. "You (reformist men) condemn atrocities on women outside your house, and are not concerned about the wretched condition of women in your families; you discourage purdah in meetings everywhere but never want to loosen your grip over the lives of your women." The tendency to talk in glowing terms about the Bengal and Maharashtra Renaissance was severely criticised by him since these men while talking a handful of women from the two provinces turned a blind eye to the need for reform amongst the women from the Hindi speaking provinces. Reform in the lives of women was not possible only through education, because education as it existed could not create an identity for women. To be able to have a voice and an identity, a strong movement and organisation for women was needed. "The day our docile and simple womenfolk get impacted by education in a manner similar to Bengal will be the last day for orthodoxy and ritualism in our country."^{lvii}

United Provinces in the nineteenth century was a territory that witnessed the interplay of colonial education and feudal values. Feminist struggle in this geography therefore had to overcome a stronger opposition than elsewhere to take root. It was in the backdrop of these values that educated reformist men like Bharatendu could not accept the companionship that the stepping out of wives with their husbands denoted. Balakrishna Bhatt however represented the section of male intelligentsia of the province that found the transition from the traditional to the modern, from unequal subservience to equal partnership, natural. "Countries where human civilisation has reached its zenith, women have a status equal to men. They are even recruited in the army in the United States. Many of them are even barristers in England, but we are not supposed to even think on these lines and therefore the entire discussion on women's reform is futile." He wrote, "We had proposed earlier that women are better than men in all respects, which is an absolute truth. Our community (Hindus) is survived only at the mercy of its women folk"^{lviii} Bhatt represents the rare stream of men writers of the period who do not talk about education and conventional wisdom in the same breath, who stress upon equality more than tradition and for whom modernity was more important than domesticity.^{lix} He wrote several articles in *Hindi Pradeep* to this effect.^{lx}

A review of Bharatendu's women oriented literary works betrays a certain sense of deliberate ambiguity in its most literal sense. *Poorna Prakash Chandraprabha* is hailed as a work of fiction precluding the realism of Premchand. This novel is about Chandraprabha who is forced into a non-companionate marriage with Dhundhiraj, who buys her from her father Anand Vighra. Chandraprabha is rescued by her mother Gunamanjari who not only gets her married to her lover Poornaprakah but also rebukes Anandvighra for having sold off their daughter. The courageous portrayal of Gunamanjari notwithstanding, the handling of the issue of authorship of this novel substantiates skepticism over the intent of the author. Ramvilas Sharma credits Bharatendu with the authorship of *Poornaprakash Chandraprabha* but also hints at the ambiguity in it: "I have witnessed two copies of this novel. The copy from Khadgavilas Press Patna has Bharatendu Harishchandra's name as its author but another copy that I received from my friend Udayshankar Shastri doesn't have any author's name".^{lxi} Here the hint is towards the fact that this novel, reputed to be the first portrayal of

the voice of dissent and credited to Bharatendu is not actually Bharatendu's work but has been written by Mallika, his Bengali wife who was a Bengali. Sharma writes elsewhere, "The novel *Poornaprakash* published by Khadgavilas Press was in fact someone else's work, only edited and proofed by Bharatendu".^{lxii} Even at this point while acknowledging that this was not an original work of Bharatendu, Sharma chooses not to speak about Mallika. We find reference to Mallika in a much earlier work. In his biography on Bharatendu, Brajratna Das mentions Mallika: "She was an educated Bengali woman who learnt Hindi under Bharatendu's guidance. She has composed many verses in Bengali under the pen name Chandrika, and in Hindi she has written three novels, *Radharani*, *Saundaryamayi* and *PoornaPrakash-Chandraprabha*".^{lxiii} Yet another biographer on Bharatendu, Radhakrishna Das while cataloguing his work, mentions *PoornaPrakash-Chandraprabha* under the category, "Compiled, edited or inspired".^{lxiv} Equality of the sexes was to be written about but not implemented. Mallika on the other hand is submissive and full of gratitude to the lord, her *Swami*: "I have attempted this (writing) at the behest of my dear *Swami*, with the sole intent of making him happy with my almost negligible writing skills". Bharatendu appears to be the embodiment of the multiple strands of thought that textured the late nineteenth century reformist endeavour in the United Provinces. He supported women's education in public, but in its circumscribed format. On the personal front he arranged for home schooling of his daughter and shoved to the sidelines his writer wife, maintaining a secretive ambiguity on the issue, even getting her works published in his name.

Bharatendu group of litterateurs^{lxv} was unsure about women's reform in general and their education in particular. Writers from a later period depicted the harm that could be caused by a universal curriculum while also encouraging them to come to the fore in areas earmarked for them.^{lxvi} Juxtaposed to the image of *grihalakshmi*, an ideal woman, who was educated to create an ideal for others to emulate and was trained in accordance with the prevalent male standards, was the narrative of the social butterfly--*titli*. A 'Titli' (butterfly) was an English educated woman, almost always adulterous and extravagant. The overlap in the traditional/modern discourse that created the backdrop in which women's education was initiated in the United Provinces continued in the generation that followed it. If the earlier generation was more or less unanimous in its agenda towards women's

education, with a few voices of dissent, there was much that was status quoist about it in the generation that followed it. Premchand writing a century later said that women should be trained specifically for the kind of functions they were fit to discharge that even when he seemed to believe that women were capable of equality with men ,he refused to accept the logical implications of this recognition and tended, on such occasions ,to lapse into sarcasm!! For example, writing in 1934 he accepted that women had proven their equality with men and therefore must be paid equally for the same job .But as he neared the end of the article ,he wrote, "*Men had looked after their wives for centuries as husbands*"^{lxvii}. Also, "*Women have proved that in many fields they are not only equal but ahead of men. What is left of the family? Now it is no longer necessary that she remains without a family .In these days of unemployment so many men live off their wives' salaries. And now even unmarried women can have a child through artificial injections, so why should she be given a smaller salary. Yes, we do request them to give up their instance on solitude and take charge of their duties*"^{lxviii} Premchand's articles prescribe fairly strong measures for reform of women's condition .Written mainly in response to the popular sentiment of the day, they favoured such steps as higher marriageable age ,women's right to property and ,though only in extraordinary situations ,even divorce and abortion. However ,these articles too tended to assume that traditionally women in India had been assigned a respectable place in society;the suggestion being that even the most radical reforms could be conceived in a revivalist mould.

Conclusion

Middleclass men of the period from UP did not conform to a universal mould of reformism, their feminism while originating from colonial education strove to defy it and create a genre of feminism which was indigenous and 'customised', resulting in the consolidation of older models of patriarchy and also opening a few doors of liberal feminism for them.Premchand was a liberal husband in his personal life,supported and even applauded his wife when she stepped into the public domain via literature and politics.^{lxix}It is also reasonable to presume that even if exaggerated and biased, extreme depictions of educated women were not very far removed from truth. If not as

quarrelsome and adulterous as the 'titli' of Premchand's writings the educated women of UP definitely had a better negotiating capacity in conjugal relations. Premchand's dissatisfaction with this state of affairs betrays an erosion in the male hegemony because of the newly educated status of women. It is also symptomatic of the freedom of sexuality taken over by these women as depicted in the many stories on extra marital & premarital love. The situation must have become alarming for men as the reforms they had initiated for women, were now proving detrimental to their own authority. The process was gradual and silent - while middle class of urban UP were engrossed in the national struggle for freedom, women had very subtly gained the instruments of their own independence and had begun employing it to attain results they had long desired. Fission in male attempts to educate women become even more clearly visible when a literature on equality of sexes is surveyed.

For the middle class males of UP in colonial India, tradition was not only seen as a legitimating source of national identity, but also as a way of differentiating between the indigenous culture of the nation and the influence of the alien imperial culture. A national identity was thus framed through cognisance and contestation. Cognisance of what it needed to reform in public and a contestation of what was to remain unchanged in the domestic domain. Male writers in the Hindi public sphere used the phrase '*Devi-Ma-Sahchari -Pran*'^{1xx} for women, while positioning their codes of ideal behavior for women against an imaginary ideal of equality. Middle class male discourse however was not a monolithic block and had opinions as diverse as the ill camouflaged conventional reformism of Bharatendu, the ambivalent attitude of scholars and litterateurs like Acharya Dwivedi and the modern reformist views of a minuscule minority represented by Balakrishna Bhatt. A study of the diversity of these opinions through the corpus of literary writings of male writers in the Hindi region will be of immense help in understanding the interplay of gender and reform and offers immense avenues of research for historians of education in the region.

¹Karuna Chanana, *Interrogating Women's Education: Bounded Visions, Expanding Horizons*, Rawat Publications, 2001

²Shobna Nijhawan, *Women and Girls in the Hindi Public Sphere: Periodical Literature in Colonial North India*, Oxford University Press, 2011; Sujata S Mody, *Literature, Language, and Nation Formation: The Story of a Modern Hindi Journal 1900--1920*. ProQuest, 2008; Jyoti Atwal, 'Revisiting Premchand: Shivrani Devi on

Companionship, Reformism and Nation', *Economic and Political Weekly*, Vol. 42, No. 18 (May 5-11, 2007), pp. 1631-1637; Suman Raje, *Hindi Sahitya Ka Adha Itihas*, Bhartiya Gyanpeeth, Delhi, 2005;

ⁱⁱⁱ Karuna Chanana, 'Social Change or Social Reform' in *Socialisation, Education, and Women: Explorations in gender Identity*, edited by K Chanana, Orient Longman, New Delhi, 1988.

^{iv} See Francesca Orsini, *Print and Pleasure: Popular Literature and Entertaining Fictions in Colonial North India*, New Delhi: Permanent Black, 2009, and edited by her: *Before the Divide: Hindi and Urdu Literary Culture*, New Delhi: Orient Blackswan, 2010, -----, *The Hindi Public Sphere 1920-1940: Language and Literature in the Age of Nationalism*, OUP, 2002; Valerie Ritter, *Kāma's Flowers. Nature in Hindi Poetry and Criticism, 1885-1925*, Albany: State University of New York Press, 2011; .For an analysis of literacy in this sense in the western context, see Elizabeth Eisenstein's paper, 'On the Printing Press as an Agent of Change' in David R Olson, N Torrance and A Hildyard (eds), *Literacy, Language, and Learning*, Cambridge, CUP, 1985

^v Krishna Kumar, 'Quest for Self-Identity: Cultural Consciousness and Education in Hindi Region, 1880-1950' *Economic and Political Weekly*, Vol. 25, No. 23 (Jun. 9, 1990), pp. 1247-1255; Sonal Shukla, 'Cultivating Minds, Nineteenth Century Gujarati Women journals' *Economic and Political Weekly*, 26 October, 1991; also, Nijhawan, op.cit.

^{vi} Kumkum Sangari, 'Feminist Criticism and Indian Literary History' in *Hindi: Language Discourse and Writing*, Vol.2, No.4, Jan-Mar 2002, p.33

^{vii} See Gauri Vishwanathan, *Masks of Conquest: Literary Study and British Rule in India*, Columbia University Press, New York, 1989

^{viii} Walsh Judith E, *Growing up in British India: Indian Autobiographers on Childhood and Education under the Raj*, Holmes and Meier, New York, 1983.

^{ix} See Vasudha Dalmia, *Fiction as History: The Novel and the City in Modern North India*, Permanent Black, 2019 ; Brian Hatcher, *Idioms of Improvement*, OUP, Delhi, 1996; Dipesh Chakrabarty, *Provincialising Europe*, Princeton university Press, Princeton, 2000

^{xx} Veer Bharat Talwar believes that the linkage of reformism and growth of Hindi literature should be studied separately, because in the Hindi discourse, the impact of the new found Hindi identity by the Bharatendu group was so strong that the age of reform in Hindi provinces should be called the "Age of Hindi Movement". The enthusiasm of the Hindi litterateurs split the reform agenda along ideological lines, of status quosim and controlled reform.

^{xi} Veer Bharat Talwar, *Rassakashi: Unnisween Sadi ka Navajagaran aur Pashchimottar Prant*, Saransh Prakashan, New Delhi 2002

^{xii} Kumkum Sangari, 'Feminist Criticism and Indian Literary History' in *Hindi: Language Discourse and Writing*, Vol.2, No.4, Jan-Mar 2002, p.33

^{xiii} Sanjay Joshi's term 'fractured modernity' is an apt depiction of the middle class Hindi discourse of the period. Sanjay Joshi, *Fractured Modernity*, op.cit. p.14-15

^{xiv} Brajratna Das, *Bharatendu Harishchandra*, Hindustani Akademi Allahabad, 1935; Ramvilas Sharma, *Bharatendu Yug aur Hindi Bhasha Ki Vikas Parampara*, Rajkamal Prakashan, Delhi, 1975; -----, *Bharatendu Harishchandra aur Hindi Navajagaran ki Samasyayein*, Delhi, 1989; Shivnandan Sahay, *Harishchandra*, Hindi Samiti, Uttar Pradesh Shasan, 1905, reprint, 1975, Lucknow.

^{xv} Vasudha Dalmia, *The Nationalisation of Hindu Traditions: Bharatendu Harishchandra and Nineteenth Century Benaras*, Delhi, OUP, 1998 p.56

^{xvi} Vasudha Dalmia, *The Nationalization Of Hindu Traditions*, ibid., p.13

^{xvii} Vir Bharat Talwar, *Stree Shiksha ke sambandh me Hunter Aayog ke Samaksh Bharatendu ka bayan*, Unpublished paper, IAS, Simla, 2001.

^{xviii} Poromesh Acharya, 'Indigenous Education and Brahmanical Hegemony in Bengal', in Nigel Crook (ed), *The Transmission of Knowledge in South Asia: Essays on Education, Religion, History and Politics*, OUP, New Delhi, 1996

^{xix} Francesca Orsini, *Domesticity and Beyond: Hindi Women's Journals in the Early Twentieth Century*, SAR, 19, 2 (1999), pp.137-60

^{xx}I owe this reference to Alok Rai. See Alok Rai, *Hindi Nationalism*, Orient Blackswan, Delhi, 2001, p.24/Also see *Census Report of the United Provinces of Agra and Awadh, 1921*, p.147

^{xxi} Pratap Naryan Mishra was called Edison of Hindi Literature by Ramvilas Sharma in his work *Hindi sahitya ka itihās, op.cit.*, p.257. Also, Vijashankar Mall, (ed.) *Pratap Naryan Mishra Granthawali*, Nagri Pracharini Sabha, Kashi, 1992.

^{xxii} Mall, *Pratap Naryan Mishra Granthawali*, op.cit., p.98

^{xxiii} In Bengal, the most well known journal was the *Balabodhini Patrika*, which came out in 1863 to continue upto 1906. It was managed by Kailashkamini Dutt and edited by her husband Umesh Chand Dutt; both were ardent Brahmos. The journal proved to be immensely popular, and had a circulation of above 1000 by eighties of the nineteenth century. See Meredith Borthwick, *The Changing Role of Women in Bengal 1849-1905*, Princeton University Press, Princeton, 1984. Sonal Shukla, 'Cultivating Minds, Nineteenth Century Gujarati Women Journals' *Economic and Political Weekly*, 26 October, 1991

^{xxiv} Despite the indispensable and respectful nomenclature of all the works of Bharatendu, there was no discussion of the contents, content or material of this magazine, or anywhere else, nor were its copies accessible anywhere! It was therefore important to bring the points of Balabodhini collected from various sources to the Hindi world in the form of a booklet, which has been compiled by Sanjeev Kumar and Vasudha Dalmia. See Vasudha Dalmia and Sanjeev Kumar (ed.), *Balabodhini*, Rajkamal Prakashan, Delhi, 2014.

^{xxv} I am grateful to Mr Nawal Krishna, the Director of Bharat Kala Bhawan at Varanasi for having made available the complete files of Bharatendu's journals for my research.

^{xxvi} The frontispiece of the journal contained few couplets:

*Jo Hari Soi Radhika Jo Shiv soi Shakti
Jo Naari soi Purush Kacchu na Vibhakti*

This was followed by a statement:

"*Stree janon ki pyaari Hindi bhasha me Sudhari*"

A tract was also included of which the most innovative line was:

*Padhai gunai seekhain nasain sab sog
Naari Nar ardhang ki Sachain hee swamini hoi*

Sanjiv Kumar and Vasudha Dalmia, *Balabodhini*, Rajkamal Prakashan, Delhi, 2014

^{xxvii} *Balabodhini*, January, 1874, p.1

^{xxviii} Bharatendu Harishchandra, *Kavivachan Sudha*, 3 Nov 1873, p.12

^{xxix} *Buth Tajahi matsar,
narinar sam hohi,
jab anand lahai*

Bharatendu Harishchandra, *Kavivachan Sudha*, 3 Nov 1873, p.14

^{xxx} *Taji garam kavita sukavijanki amrit bani sab kahi* (only when learned poets give up colloquialism and write on equality of two sexes, shall there happiness prevail). See Sujata Rai, *Rashtriya Jagaran aur Hindi Patrakarita ka Aadikaal*, Anamika publishers and distributors, Delhi 1996

^{xxxi} Bharatendu Harishchandra, *Kavi Vachan Sudha* Nov 3, 1873, p.15

^{xxxii} It was pointed out that though women of Hindi have many admirable qualities, they had many bad traits as well which can all be traced to a lack of knowledge. But they have never been taught, so the real fault lies with men, who never imparted learning to them. *Hindustan ki striyon ke liye shiksha*, in the *Kulinstri Kriti*, a missionary manual, for women of good families (1894) p.146. Vir Bharat Talwar's incisive comment that women's oppressors, that is men were the ones to have initiated reform for them deserves mention in this context. See Vir Bharat Talwar, 'Feminist Consciousness in Women's Journals in Hindi 1910-1920' in Kumkum Sangari and Sudesh Vaid, *Recasting Women*, op.cit., p.205

^{xxxiii} Ram Chandra Gupta, '*Jati Sudharak Vaishyopkarak*' vol IV, 1904, p.23

^{xxxiv} Ramvilas Sharma, op.cit., p.213; Bharatendu Harishchandra, *Matri Bhagini Sakhi Tulya Arya Lalna Gan in 'Neel Devi'*, Introduction, 1881 Quoted by Hemant Sharma, *Bharatendu Samagra* Hindi Pracharak Sansthan, Varanasi, vol III, 1989, pp.478-79

^{xxxv} 'Whenever girls of either Bengal, Bombay or Madras performed well in the exams, Bharatendu used to send them saris. Once he had sent saris to the girls of Bethune College in Calcutta which were distributed by Lady Ripon. The director of Education in Bengal, Alfred Croft wrote to him that the hall resounded with applause when the saris were distributed.' Babu Sivnandan Sahay, *Harishchandra*, Lucknow, 1975 reprint, p.214

^{xxxvi} Late nineteenth century social attitudes accorded women a place equal to sudras, that is outside the hierarchical structure of 'twice-borns'. This was especially applicable to educational matters and hence any form of learning was prohibited for women. See Dagmar Engels, *Beyond Purdah?*, OUP, Delhi, 1996, p.78

^{xxxvii} This treatise was written with the title Shilawati, ostensibly written by Shilawati, a woman of good conduct. This rather awkward double authorship device has been introduced to attribute the ensuing opinions that follow to a respectable woman, and thereby endow them with more authority. See Vasudha Dalmia, 'Generic Questions: Bharatendu and Women's Issues,' in Stuart Blackburn and Vasudha Dalmia (eds.) *India's Literary History Essays on the Nineteenth Century*, Permanent Black, 2004, New Delhi, p. 408

^{xxxviii} *Balabodhini*, January, 1874, p.2

^{xxxix} Amrit Rai ed., *Vividh Prasang*, Vol.iii, Allahabad, 1978. This is a compilation in three volumes of Premchand's writings on a variety of subjects. It covers the period from 1905-1936. In fairness to Premchand it may be mentioned here that the All India Women's Conference was at this time demanding a different kind of education for women that would equip them better for the kind of functions they had to perform.

^{xl} Amrit Rai, ed., *Vividh Prasang* op.cit, p.48-49

^{xli} See references to panditayanis and ustanis in chapter 1 above

^{xlii} I use this term here for lack of any other suitable term for women who had not received any formal schooling. As discussed by Nita Kumar, uneducated or unschooled does not mean 'ashikshit' or unaware. See Nita Kumar, *Widows Education in Benaras*, op.cit, p.56

^{xliii} Vir Bharat Talwar, op.cit, p.12

^{xliv} The Hunter Commission in order to review the work done by the state following the Wood's Dispatch of 1854, prepared a questionnaire which was put before few influential men of the NWP & Oudh. They included Sir Syed Ahmad, Raja Shivprasad, Raja Udaypratap Singh, Raja Shivparatap Singh, Pt. Lakshmmishankar Mishra, Babu Totaram and Babu Durgaprasad. See Shrinarayan Pandey, Bharatendu Harishchandra: Naye Sandarb ki Talash, Shabd bharti, Allahabad in Vir Bharat Talwar, *Rassakashi: Unnisween Sadi ka Navajagaran aur Pashchimottar Prant*, Saransh Prakashan, New Delhi 2002, pp12-15

^{xlv} Ibid, p.78

^{xlvi} *Saraswati* was the first Hindi monthly magazine of India. Founded in 1900, by Chintamani Ghosh, the proprietor of Indian Press, in Allahabad, its success under the editorship of litterateur Mahavir Prasad Dwivedi (1903-1920), led to flourishing of modern Hindi prose and poetry especially in Khariboli dialect. It became the most influential periodical in Hindi literature during the first two decades of the 20th century. Sisir Kumar Das, *History of Indian Literature: 1911-1956, struggle for freedom: triumph and tragedy*. Sahitya Akademi, Delhi, 1995; Sujata S Mody, *Literature, Language, and Nation Formation: The Story of a Modern Hindi Journal 1900--1920*. *ProQuest*, 2008

^{xlvii} Hazari Prasad Dwivedi, 'Stree Shiksha ke virodhi ki tarko ka khandan' in Krishnakumari (ed.), *Mahila Mod*, Ganga Pustak Mala, Lucknow, 1925

^{xlviii} Mahaveer Prasad Dwivedi, 'Striyon ka Samajik Jeewan', in Bharat Yayawar (ed) *Mahaveer Prasad Dwivedi Rachnawali, Part VII*, Kitabghar, Delhi, 1995, p.97

^{xlix} Manu Smriti recommends that a woman should always be protected by men-by her father during childhood, by her husband as an adult and by her son during her old age. See G Buhler, *Manusmriti: The Laws of Manu*. *Trans. G. Buhler*, 25, 1886. ; Uma Chakravarti, 'Conceptualising brahmanical patriarchy in early India: Gender, caste, class and state' *Economic and Political Weekly*, 579-585, (1993), Uma Chakravarti, 'Gender, caste and labour: Ideological and material structure of widowhood' *Economic and Political Weekly*, 2248-2256, 1995.

^l Mahaveer Prasad Dwivedi, 'Striyon ka Samajik Jeewan', in Bharat Yayawar (ed) *Mahaveer Prasad Dwivedi Rachnawali, Part VII*, Kitabghar, Delhi, 1995, p.97

^{li} Pandit Moolchand Bhatt, *Bhatt Nibandh Mala*, Vol 1 and 2, Nagri Pracharini Sabha, 1973.

^{lii} Shaligram Gupta, 'Stree Shiksha ki Aavashyakta', in *Saraswati*, January-June, 1917

^{liii} In the field of Hindi journalism, the name of Pandit Balkrishna Bhatt (Balkrishna Bhatt) is not only due to the fame of "Hindi Pradeep", his disciples also have famous names like Pandit Madan Mohan Malaviya and Rajarshi Purushottam Das Tandon.. In 1877, he founded the "Hindi Vardhini Sabha" with the inspiration of Bharatendu Harishchandra. The famous "Hindi Pradeep" came out under this meeting, which was released by Bharatendu himself. He was its editor for thirty-two years and continued to run it regularly. Apart from Hindi Pradeep, Balkrishna Bhatt also edited two or three other magazines. Biographical Reference from www.hindisamy.com

^{liv} Balkrishna Bhatt, *Hindi Pradeep*, July 1891

^{lv} *Striyonki shiksha qaum ki tarakki ki pehli seedhihai ,yah tabhi ho sakta hai jabinmewoh vivek aave jo aam shiksha se hi smabhav hai.* Bal Krishna Bhatt, *ibid*, p.45.

^{lvi} If women were excessively liberated there was no guarantee that they would either accept the moral straitjacket imposed on them or the sexual double standards allowed for men. Malvika Karlekar, 'Kadambini and the Bhadrak- Early Debates over Women's Education in Bengal', *Economic and Political Weekly*, Vol. 21, Issue No. 17, 26 Apr, 1986

^{lvii} Balkrishna Bhatt, 'Stree Swatantrya' in *Hindi Pradeep*, April-June, 1891, p.29

^{lviii} Bhatt, *Hindi Pradeep*, July 1891, p.7

^{lix} They include *Dhol gawaar shudra PashuNaari*(1882), *Striyaan aur unki Shiksha*(1885), *Striyon ki Maansik Sthiti*(1884), *Pati Patni*(1885), *Hamari Lalnao ki Shochnaeeya Dasha*(1894), *Sugrihini*(1895), *Vijay Lakshmi*(1897), *Striyaan Aheri hain ki Purush Aher ahin*(1898), *Mahila Swaatantrya*(1891), *Mister Malabari ke Vichaar Ki Poshakata*(1890), *Bal Vivaah*(1880), *Kashtatkashtaramsudha*(1903), *Kya hum apna Khoya hua Mahatva Paa sakte hain* (1906), *Vadhu Stavraj*(1905)

Bhatt, *Hindi Pradeep*, July 1885-1903

^{lx} *ibid*, p.67-69

^{lxi} Ramvilas Sharma, *Bharatendu Yug aur hindi bhasha ki vikas parampara*, Rajkamal Prakashan, Delhi, 1975, p.89-90

^{lxii} Ram Vilas Sharma, *Bharatendu Harishchandra aur Hindi Navjagran ki samasyayein*, Rajkamal Prakashan, Delhi, 1989, p.141-43.

^{lxiii} Brajratna Das, *Bharatendu Harishchandra*, Allahabad, 1935

^{lxiv} Radhakrishna Das, *Bharatendu Babu ka Jeevan Charitra*, Naval Kishore Press, Lucknow, 1976, p.155

^{lxv} Ramchandra Shukla includes Balkrishna Bhatt, Shaligram Gupt, Murlidhar Bhatt, Pratapnarain Mishra, Shrinivas Das, Babu Totatram, Radhacharan Goswami in this group. See Shukla, *Hindi Sahitya ka Itihas*, op.cit, p.462

^{lxvi} Of particular note here is the writing of Shivrani Devi. Shivrani Devi, *Premchand: Ghar mein*, Saraswati Press, 1956, reprinted, Atma Ram and Sons, Delhi, 1981. In this book, Premchand's wife Shivrani Devi has recorded memoirs of her domestic life. A gendered analysis of this work has been attempted by Jyoti Atwal who has looked at Premchand from Shivrani Devi's viewpoint in her article. Jyoti Atwal, 'Revisiting Premchand: Shivrani Devi on Companionship, Reform and Nation', *EPW*, vol 42, no.8, 5-11, May 2007, pp1631-7. Shivrani Devi's writings stand in sharp contrast to Mallika's story in its portrayal of a more liberal companionate nuptial bond between Shivrani and Premchand.

^{lxviii} *Ibid*, p.218

^{lxix} Jyoti Atwal, 'Revisiting Premchand: Shivrani Devi on Companionship, Reformism and Nation' in *Economic and Political Weekly*, Vol. 42, No. 18 (May 5-11, 2007), pp. 1631-1637

^{lxx} The famous Hindi poet Sumitranandan Pant summed up the middle class male construct in his verse when he ascribes the divine (*Devi*), motherly (*maa*), companionate (*sahchari*), and soulful (*pran*) qualities ascribed these qualities to women in his verse. Sumitranandan Pant, *Pallav*, (*Kavita Sangrah*), Rajkamal Prakashan, Delhi, (1924, reprint 1998), p.81